1. Agenda Approval

Changes or additions to the agenda.

BOARD ACTION

I move to approve the agenda as posted.

2. Minutes Approval

BOARD ACTION

I move to approve the minutes for the December 13, 2023, Regular Board meeting, the December 14, 2023, Special Board meeting, the December 21, 2023, Special Board meeting and the January 9, 2024, Special Board meeting.

3. Rolling Calendar

BOARD ACTION

I move to set February 19-20, 2025, as the date and Boise State University as the location for the February 2025 regularly scheduled Board meeting.

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023



STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING December 13, 2023 Office of the State Board of Education 650 West State Street, Suite 307 Boise, ID 83720

A regular meeting of the Idaho State Board of Education was held via zoom teleconference on December 13, 2023, with the call originating from the Office of the State Board of Education in Boise. Board President Dr. Linda Clark called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. (MT).

<u>Present</u>

Dr. Linda Clark, President William G. Gilbert, Jr., Vice-President Superintendent Critchfield, Secretary Dr. David Hill Kurt Liebich Shawn Keough Cally Roach Cindy Siddoway

<u>Absent</u>

None

Wednesday, December 13, 2023 - 10:00 a.m. (Mountain Time)

BOARDWORK

1. Agenda Review and Approval – Action Item

Mr. Gilbert began the meeting by stating that the State Department of Education (SDE) had asked to remove item number 4, Assessment Item Review Committee Recommendation from their portion of the agenda. For consistency it was also recommended to move Planning, Policy, and Governmental Affairs (PPGA) item number 5. Educator Pipeline Report to precede PPGA agenda item number 4. Registered Teacher Apprenticeship Program Standards.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to approve the agenda as amended. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

2. Minutes Review and Approval – Action Item

BOARD ACTION

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

M/S (Gilbert / Critchfield) I move to approve the minutes for the October 18-19, 2023, Regular Board meeting, and the November 13, 2023, Special Board meeting. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

3. Rolling Calendar – Action Item

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Siddoway) I move to set December 18, 2024, as the date for the December 2024 regularly scheduled Board Meeting, to occur via videoconference originating from the Office of the State Board of Education in Boise. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

CONSENT

- BAHR
- 1. Idaho State University Men's Head Football Coach Contract Action Item

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to approve the request by Idaho State University to enter into a five (5) employment agreement with Cody Hawkins, Head Football Coach, commencing on January 1, 2024, and terminating on January 26, 2029, at a base salary of \$222,000 and supplemental compensation provisions, as submitted. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

2. Idaho State University – Men's Head Basketball Coach Contract - Action Item

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to approve the request by Idaho State University to enter into a 4-year 5-month employment agreement with Ryan Looney, Head Men's Basketball Coach, commencing on January 1, 2024, and terminating on May 7, 2028, at a base salary of \$123,687 and supplemental compensation provisions, as submitted. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

PPGA

3. Accountability Oversight Committee Appointment – Action Item

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to approve the appointment of Geoff Penrose to the Accountability Oversight Committee, as the member with experience as a school principal or charter school administrator, for a term of 2 years commencing December 13, 2023, and ending on June 30, 2025. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

4. Idaho State Rehabilitation Council Appointments – Action Item

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to appoint Angie Tuft as a representative of Business, Labor, and Industry for a three-year term, effective immediately through December 12, 2026. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

AND

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to appoint Jeff DeForest as a representative of Business, Labor, and Industry for a three-year term, effective immediately through December 12, 2026. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

AND

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to appoint Lucas Rose as a representative of Business, Labor, and Industry for a three-year term, effective immediately through December 12, 2026. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

AND

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to appoint Emily Flynn as a representative of VR Counselor General for a three-year term, effective immediately through December 12, 2026. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

AND

M/S (Gilbert / Hill)I move to appoint Kent Ireton as a representative of VR Counselor Pre-Employment Transition Services for a three-year term, effective immediately through December 12, 2026. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

5. Indian Education Committee Appointments – Action Item

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to appoint Mr. Justin Marsh, as the Coeur d'Alene Tribal Education Department representative to the Idaho Indian Education Committee ef2023,ive December 13, 2023, and expiring June 30, 2026. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

AND

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to appoint Councilwoman Yvonne Powers, as the Shoshone-Paiute Tribes' chair designee to the Idaho Indian Education Committee effective August 23, 2023, and expiring June 30, 2028. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

AND

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to appoint Ms. Lynn Manning John, as the Shoshone-Paiute Tribes' Tribal Education Department representative to the Idaho Indian Education Committee effective August 23, 2023, and expiring June 30, 2028. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

6. Empowering Parents Business Procedures – Action Item

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to approve the Empowering Parents Business Procedures as presented in Attachment 1. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

SDE

7. Curricular Materials Selection Committee Appointments – Action Item

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to approve the request by the State Department of Education to appoint Kristi Enger to the Curricular Materials Selection Committee for a five-year term, effective December 13, 2023, and ending December 13, 2028, representing Career Technical Education. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

AND

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to approve the request by the State Department of Education to appoint Emalee Merrell to the Curricular Materials Selection Committee for a five-year term, effective December 13, 2023, and ending December 13, 2028, representing the State Department of Education. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

AND

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to approve the request by the State Department of Education to appoint Bernadette Edwards to the Curricular Materials Selection Committee for a five-year term, effective December 13, 2023, and ending

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

December 13, 2028, representing local school board members. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

AND

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to approve the request by the State Department of Education to appoint Jessica Geiger to the Curricular Materials Selection Committee for a five-year term, effective December 13, 2023, and ending December 13, 2028, representing parents. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

AND

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to approve the request by the State Department of Education to appoint Kirsten Pomerantz to the Curricular Materials Selection Committee for a five-year term, effective December 13, 2023, and ending December 13, 2028, representing higher education. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

AND

M/S (Gilbert / Hill)I move to approve the request by the State Department of Education to appoint Lisa Olsen to the Curricular Materials Selection Committee for a five-year term, effective December 13, 2023, and ending December 13, 2028, representing Idaho certified educators. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

8. Emergency Provisional Certificates – Action Item

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to authorize the State Department of Education to issue emergency provisional standard instructional certificates for candidates 1-117 as presented above, effective for the 2023-2024 school year only, and pending a cleared background check. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to approve the consent agenda. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

INSTRUCTION, RESEARCH AND STUDENT AFFAIRS

1. Board Policy III.L. Prior Learning and III.Y. Advanced Opportunities – First Reading – Action Item

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

Tracie Bent, Chief Administrative Officer, Career Technical Education, recapped the item for the members of the Board. She shared that the Division of Career Technical Education is requesting amendments to Board Policy III.Y. Advanced Opportunities and III.L. Prior Learning. The amendments to Policy III.Y would replace what is now referred to as technical competency credit with microcredentials. The Board finalized amendments to Board Policy III.E. in December 2022, clarifying the definition of microcredentials and the platform that is used to track them. The platform used for tracking microcredentials was originally developed to, in part, track competencies students mastered through secondary programs eligible for technical competency credits.

Board policy III.L. Prior Learning currently allows institutions to award credit for prior learning based on non-credit courses, experiential learning, or portfolios, which could include microcredentials. The policy does not call out or identify microcredentials in the same way as it identifies exams like CLEP or AP. By adding the reference to microcredentials to Board policy III.L. it heightens awareness of microcredentials and the potential for stacking them to award not only credits but certificates and degrees.

In addition, proposed amendments to Board policies III.L and III.Y will provide clarification on how microcredentials can be used to show how students are meeting the same outcomes that were previously referred to in technical competency credit eligible programs and highlight their use for evaluating credit for prior learning.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Hill / Gilbert) I move to approve the first reading of amendments to Board policies III.L and III.Y. as provided in attachments 1 and 2. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

Dr. Hill asked if each state is doing this work independently or is there a convergence happening where across the education system, they're standard definitions for like competency. Ms. Bent said career technical education looks at competencies and outcomes. There's similar work in other states because each of the programs work with business and industry within those different occupational areas, but it can be very different from state to state, depending on what their priorities are. As far as badging and microcredentialing, there isn't a standard across the nation in the sense of how each state is recognizing and using them at the statewide level, but there is work being done nationwide.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

2. College of Eastern Idaho – Bachelor of Applied Science, Digital Forensics and Analytics – Action Item

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

Prior to the start of the discussion Dr. Hill gave the Board members the process to move forward with the next three action items. He said that the Board amended Policy III. Z recently setting out the criteria for acceptance of Bachelor of Science degrees via Idaho's community colleges. The three proposals before the Board will be taken one by one as they are audited in increasing complexity. In each case, the Board will have to decide whether, first, the proposed program meets the criteria. And if it does not, there will have to be a motion to waive the policy. And secondly, to approve the action item or not, subject to the first motion.

Josh Duersch, Cybersecurity and Technology Department Chair, College of Eastern Idaho, said the College of Eastern Idaho proposes a new Bachelor of Applied Science in digital forensics and analytics degree. This program aims to provide an upper division pathway for Associate of Applied Science graduates with advanced knowledge in digital forensics and analytics and the related concepts.

Mr. Duersch further shared that along with there being a growing demand for this course of study a careful review of offerings in the state showed that there are no digital forensics programs in the state offered by Idaho public institutions. For students, because this is a bachelor's program, student graduates can expect to see higher salaries upon graduation. This program does have a flexible program structure. It is designed to be an evening cohort accommodating working professionals.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Hill / Siddoway) I move to approve the request by College of Eastern Idaho to create a new program that will award a Bachelor of Applied Science in Digital Forensics and Analytics in substantial conformance to the program proposal submitted as Attachment 1. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

AND

M/S (Hill / Siddoway) I move to direct the college to submit an annual financial and enrollment report of the program to the office of the State Board of Education for the first five years of the program. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

Board President Dr. Linda Clark asked about the funding model for offering this program and for a little more detail on the mechanics of getting the funding. Mr. Duersch said to start out they will use the upper division tuition differential, or \$280 a credit which is in line with College of Southern Idaho's upper division tuition. If that funding model does not work, they will revert to CEI's tuition model which will need to be approved by CEI's local board of trustees.

Dr. Clark asked how CEI would make up the difference in funding if their local board did not approve the higher funding model. Mr. Duersch said CEI was very fortunate to have

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

a good working relationship with the Idaho National Lab and CEI would continue to have two INL instructors teach lower division cybersecurity courses.

Dr. Hill asked if CEI had thought about how many more of these proposals would they be bringing forward in the next few years. President Aman said the two proposals before the Board today represent the most immediate need in region 6 to support local industry partners. Dr. Hill then said knowing that it takes 3-5 years to get any new program up and running can the Board be assured that no new requests would be forthcoming until CEI was sure this program was a success. President Aman said conceivably if this program is a success CEI might bring forward another request for a Bachelor of Applied Science degree in 18 or 24 months. A lot will depend on the demand for these courses from the local community and from workforce partners.

Dr. Hill asked Dr. Bliss if the Board office gathers data on baccalaureate programs to verify if they have met their projections for enrollment along with other metrics. Dr. Bliss said yes; however, schools are only required to report back every 5 years, not annually, on how a program is doing. Dr. Bliss said perhaps with these programs a better review timeline would look at the financial outlay and the enrollments on an annual basis, which the institutions track yearly anyway. President Aman joined in and said that reporting these findings yearly was not a burden for CEI as they had to report these numbers to their own locally elected Board, so this request was an easy one to accommodate.

Lori Barber, Vice President, Academic and Student Affairs, College of Eastern Idaho, added to the discussion by saying that there are 34 learners majoring in operations and an additional 32 learners taking upper division courses for spring and they expect those numbers to continue to rise. CEI is anticipating having 40 students enroll in this course within a three-year timeframe. Implementation of this new program will begin in Fall of 2025 if the Board approves this motion today.

Dr. Bliss outlined for the Board the five specific criteria for evaluating proposed baccalaureate degrees by the community colleges:

- "Demand: Proposed offerings must be to meet an urgent, local need based on where students who complete the offering will be employed rather than on where the students reside.
- "Specialization: The proposed offering must be based on the unique capability at the institution, founded on specialized instructional expertise and any infrastructure necessary for program delivery.
- "Non-competitiveness: The proposed offering must be non-competitive with other institutions' offerings within the identified service area (whether regional or statewide) and supported by other institutions within the service area.
- "Collaboration: Alternative approaches to meeting the identified demand addressed by the proposed offering should be fully considered, including potential collaboration with other institutions.

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

• Resources: The institution must have sufficient resources to develop and deliver the proposed offering."

Dr. Bliss added that Policy III.Z. states all baccalaureate and graduate level programs approved by the board require a report on the program's progress in accordance with the timeframe and template developed by the executive director or designee. Dr. Bliss further shared with the Board that typically when a program such as this is on track, they do not bring reports to the full Board but to the Board subcommittees.

Patty Sanchez, Academic Affairs Program Manager, Idaho State Board of Education, shared that the Board office, in consultation with the institutions developed a template for reporting on these types of programs. This template consists of enrollment and graduation numbers. The Board office then compares those numbers with the original projections to see where the realities are. The institutions are then asked a series of questions such as what challenges did they face in offering the course and if they planned to continue the program or make adjustments to the curriculum. If after making curriculum changes the enrollment numbers are still not reached those reviews come to the full Board. Baccalaureate programs come to the Board for review after 6 years and 3-4 years for graduation programs.

Mrs. Roach said an overarching strategic goal for the state board is access and affordability for all students. In her opinion Board policy is a bit too restrictive. In this instance, we need to take into account the needs of the local communities. Local business and community members are supportive of this program. I think there is room in our system for something bigger. Let us embrace every student in their local environment with an affordable option.

Superintendent Critchfield shared that driving around the state and seeing the different communities has brought into focus for her that not everyone has access to a 4-year institution, but the community colleges can reach those populations and many people prefer in-person instruction over remote.

Dr. Hill amended the motion to include reporting mechanisms that would need to be brought back to the Board annually for the first 5 years. The metrics that need to be reported would include placement of graduating students, and employability, which should prove industry demand. He further said that this particular proposal meets the intent of Board Policy III.Z. as written and would not require a waiver.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

 College of Eastern Idaho – Bachelor of Applied Science, Operations Management – Action Item

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

Ms. Barber led the discussion. She shared that the degree being presented today is the identical degree that has been implemented and approved with great success at the College of Southern Idaho. This operations management degree will allow students to transfer their credits from an applied associate degree such as welding or diesel technology directly into this applied bachelor's degree and allow them to complete that bachelor's degree in region 6. This course is really designed for those learners who want to start their own business or provide the skills they need to move into management with a degree that honors all of their applied credits, and then also honors previous experience in the form of credit for prior learning. The degree will be delivered in the evening to accommodate those who are working full-time without them having to travel outside the region.

Graduates would be able to go into living wage jobs and help meet the demand for various positions that are coming to the region through the INL Lab and other organizations in region 6.

The program will offer evening classes in Idaho Falls initially, and then face to face in remote outposts such as Drake, Rexburg, Arco, and Salmon, where there will be credentialed faculty and facilities.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Hill / Critchfield) I move to waive Board Policy III.Z. 2. B. IV only as it relates to the College of Eastern Idaho's Bachelor of Applied Science Operations management degree. A roll call vote was taken, the motion carried 5-3. Dr. Linda Clark, William G. Gilbert, Jr., and Dr. David Hill voted nay.

AND

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Hill / Critchfield) I move to approve the request by College of Eastern Idaho to create a new program that will award a Bachelor of Applied Science in Operations Management in substantial conformance to the program proposals submitted in attachment one and to direct the college to submit an annual financial and enrollment report of the program to the Office of the State Board of Education for the first 5 years of the program. A roll call vote was taken, the motion carried 5-3. Dr. Linda Clark, William G. Gilbert, Jr., and Dr. David Hill voted nay.

Dr. Hill asked for a little more information on the requirements for CTE credits and specifically what that requirement was. Ms. Barber said CEI will take 60 credits of an applied associate degree that can be used for the first 2 years of this degree. It is in third and fourth year where they would get the upper division credits that would allow them to maybe start their own business or move into a management position. Industry partners have also stressed that turning years of experience into education credits is

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

something that needs to be defined. It will be up to faculty to validate this experience and turn it into credits.

Mr. Liebich asked for a clearer structure of how this program will work. Hypothetically, if I'm a student at CEI and I get my associate degree I can decide to continue at CEI to get my bachelor's degree which should be cheaper; where all 60 of my credits will be recognized and where CEI is more flexible in classroom meeting time. In addition, CEI will give me work experience credits that I can apply towards my degree. Or I can transfer to ISU to complete my degree but would be unsure if all 60 credits would transfer, no work experience credits would be applied, and courses would not be offered in as flexible an atmosphere. Ms. Barber said yes, that was accurate, adding that the cost for the upper division courses would be \$285 a unit. And on the flip side it would be hard for a student to enter the program with a two-year degree that they earned elsewhere.

Dr. Adam Bradford, Provost, Idaho State University, supplied that ISU does take all 60 credits from an applied associate degree into their current business programming. ISU has multiple pathways through their business programming to accommodate BAS students and have been doing this for 20 years. ISU also gives credit for prior learning, and they can offer classes at the Idaho Falls campus in person if there were student demand. Dr. Bradford added that if industry partners had shared this need with ISU they would have stepped up and offered this program.

Dr. Hill then referenced the five specific criteria for evaluating proposed baccalaureate degrees by the community colleges that was discussed in agenda item number 2. This current request does not pass that review and there has been significant pushback from Idaho's 4-year Universities in moving this request forward. Dr. Bradford added that he would ask the Board members to be aware that the criteria they set up in terms of specialized instructional expertise was not being met with this degree. This proposed degree is a fairly generic operations management / business degree. ISU already offers a very similar degree with a strong operations management focus. As a result, this degree, as offered, fails the non-competitive benchmark. Students can essentially achieve a business degree that does not have the same kind of accreditation standard or demands that ISUs does, and it will be offered at a significantly lower price.

Further, Dr. Bradford shared that this request creates an incentive structure for those students to move away from accredited programming with a very long history of successful placement of students to a non-accredited degree program that will hamper ISUs ability to continue to draw students into their program. Also, according to the five criteria set forth in Board policy there was no discussion between ISU and CEI to talk about collaboration. If there had been ISU would have offered suggestions on the delivery of a program that would suit the needs of the students. As it stands this program being proposed by CEI is problematically duplicative and will result in wasteful duplication of resources.

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

Mrs. Roach said she was convinced that we are talking about different demographic groups. This program allows us to expand our offerings. Let's explore and move forward and test the theory with this program. The state of Florida has expanded into this model and degree completions have expanded.

Dr. Hill then synthesized the discussion saying that based on the discussions as presented he would need to add a motion to waive Policy III.Z. before voting on the proposal as presented because this proposal does not meet the criteria in III.Z. without the Board waiving policy. Dr. Hill said he takes waiving of policy very seriously because if you continue to waive policy, then you have no policy.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

At this time the Board took a 30-minute break returning at 12:15 p.m.

4. College of Western Idaho – Bachelor of Applied Science, Business Administration – Action Item

Gordon Jones, President, College of Western Idaho, presented the agenda item. He shared that this is about an applied degree that involves career technical education curriculum embedded in it. This proposal is unique and distinctive and a hallmark of how community colleges both teach and what they're known for. This degree proposal also targets the employment and workforce demands for the local community.

Denise Aberle-Cannata, Provost, College of Western Idaho, continued the discussion saying CWI engaged with a third party to do a feasibility study to help provide guidance and direction to also research who are the students that this degree would apply too. A recent survey showed that 56% of the community college students who went on to get a bachelor's degree stated they would not have done so because it would have been economically impossible if they wouldn't have had that pathway provided by their local community college. Initially CWI would launch this program with existing faculty and campus resources. CWI intends to fund this program initially with their own investment.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Hill / Roach) I move to waive Board Policy III.Z. 2. B. IV only as it relates to the College of Western Idaho's Bachelor of Applied Science in Business Administration. A roll call vote was taken, the motion carried 5-3. Dr. Linda Clark, William G. Gilbert, Jr., and Dr. David Hill voted nay.

AND

BOARD ACTION M/S (Hill / Siddoway) I move to approve the request by the College of Western Idaho to offer a Bachelor of Applied Science in Business Administration as

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

provided in Attachment 1 and direct the college to submit an annual financial and enrollment report of the program to the Office of the State Board of Education for the first 5 years of the program. A roll call vote was taken, the motion carried 5-3. Dr. Linda Clark, William G. Gilbert, Jr., and Dr. David Hill voted nay.

Board President Dr. Clark asked for an expansion of the comment that CWI was going to fund the initial startup of this program with their own resources, specifically asking what the cost per credit hour would be and how will they fund the excess costs the institution might incur over and above what the tuition will fund. Ms. Aberle-Cannata said lower-level courses will be \$139 a unit, and \$170 per credit hour for the upper division courses. CWI is using reserve funding to launch this program while they build enrollment. They will start the initial courses with 20-22 students. Preliminary research shows that there are over 6,000 students in the CTE program who graduated from CWI who would be a good fit to enroll in this particular program.

Board President Dr. Clark stated that the \$170 per credit for upper division courses was significantly less than partner schools and was CWI confident that this amount was sufficient to meet cost projections. Ms. Aberle-Cannata said yes because their costs don't require them to recruit and hire additional faculty to start the program.

Board President Dr. Clark asked about the platform in offering this program; the documentation says 60% online, 20% hybrid, 20% face-to-face and CWI is going to 8-week classes to facilitate a fully online experience which is in direct contradiction with some of the testimony given today. Ms. Abele-Cannata said CWI's intent is to offer face-to-face courses with some hybrid options. There are two courses that students can take online but the degree itself is being designed to be fully online at this time. Because of the population CWI serves and the need for flexibility they felt it was better to design a program that had different options for students who may or may not be able to make the trek to campus 5 nights a week due to work schedules.

Mr. Gilbert asked for an assertion that adding this program to CWI will not take away enrollment from Boise State or other institutions and wanted more information on why CWI thinks this program will draw a distinct student population. Ms. Abele-Canata said this degree most likely will appeal to those students who would not go to BSU but who are on a pure business pathway. CWI transfers 54% of business students to BSU or ISU and that is not expected to change. This degree is for those CWI students who want to add on to their technical degree without transferring to another institution.

Mr. Liebich asked if CWI was familiar with Western Governor's University and how they offer an online bachelor's degree in business with a quoted cost of \$8,000 year. Motivated students can get their degree in 2.5 years. Wouldn't it have been easier to create a transfer pathway to Western Governors University for students. President Jones said in his recent discussion with Scott Pulse, CEO of Western Governor's

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

University he admitted that WGU's focus is more nationally centric and does not connect to the local community for employment needs.

John Buckwalter, Provost, Boise State University, added to the conversation by stating that in reviewing the demand in the local area for this type of degree it is hard to see how BSU is not able to fill this gap since they already have this pathway in their curriculum. As far as the third criteria, non-competitiveness, in order to serve the local community, CWI will end up offering online courses which will directly compete with BSU as well as the other institutions in the state. CWI is also asking for the right to ask the state for money to support this degree which should bring to mind what are the long-term financial implications to the state.

Mr. Gilbert said he believes there is a need in the Treasure Valley for this type of program. However, he agreed with Dr. Hill that waiving policy to bring this forward was not good precedent. And the reality is we're not talking new dollars coming into the system to make this happen other than the tuition dollar, we have a fixed population that CWI will be drawing from. It would have been far better to place these proposals on hold until a more robust discussion about how to institutionalize this could take place.

Mrs. Roach said we have to think about the local board of trustees and honor their commitment. She will support this proposal because there is room in our market for another option. Our policy needs refinement, which we are working on by evaluating all of Policy III.Z. Sometimes interpreting policy in a manner that can be viewed differently is the best course.

Dr. Hill made the following statement for inclusion in the minutes. "Earlier we discussed how we would monitor progress on these programs. I'm advising two things. One, in policy III.G. it allows us to direct the executive director to report on any program. I therefore direct the executive director to require a report on these pilot programs progress in accordance with Board Policy III.G. post-secondary program review and approval. That is just a statement, and it doesn't require a motion. The second part of this is because requiring that report on the associate degrees that we've previously approved would constitute new business and we can't act on that today. We will have to ask staff to prepare something for a future meeting."

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

5. Engineering and Computer Science Initiative Next Steps – Action Item

Scott Greco, Deputy Director, Idaho State Board of Education, started by saying after the October Board of Education meeting the Board tasked Board staff with developing a recommendation for how the State Board of Education might proceed given the findings from the Western Interstate Commission for Higher Education (WICHE) concerning the engineering and computer science needs assessment they completed.

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

Board staff then conducted two important meetings. First with the Idaho National Labs workforce and economic development programs, and with Boise State University's College of Engineering's industry advisory board. At these meetings a proposal by the Idaho Advanced Energy Consortium's workforce and education committee was made to request an executive order from the governor to form an engineering and computer science higher education steering committee. The consortium's vision is an industry-led steering committee with State Board of Education representation organized to address three of the most pressing challenges in production of engineering computer science focused graduates.

- 1. Facilitate convenings and work sessions between institutions to pinpoint breakdowns in matriculation pathways, specifically from community colleges to four-year institutions.
- 2. Map pathways from each community college and four-year institution across all engineering and computer science degree program.
- 3. Design a pilot pathway for recipients of associate of applied science degrees or intermediate technical certificate programming to progress into Bachelor of Applied Science, Bachelor of Arts, and/or Bachelor of Science degree programs.

The Board of Education's Chief Academic Officer, Dr. TJ Bliss and Mr. Greco participated in the first meeting of the workforce and education committee organized by Micron and Idaho's Workforce Development Council. This meeting validated those three priorities. The committee recommends that the State Board support the recommendation of the Idaho Advanced Energy Consortium's workforce and education subcommittee for the establishment of an engineering and computer science Higher education steering committee.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Hill / Roach) I move to support the recommendation of the Idaho Advanced Energy Consortium's Workforce & Education Subcommittee for the establishment of an Engineering & Computer Science Higher Education Steering Committee. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

BUSINESS AFFAIRS AND HUMAN RESOURCES

1. Amendment to Board Policy – Section V.T. Fee Waivers – First Reading

Patrick Coulson, Chief Financial Officer, Idaho State Board of Education, said Institutions currently covered under this policy have identified situations in which some students lose eligibility for this waiver prior to degree completion, or due to gaps in their education due to medical events or other emergency circumstances.

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

The proposed modifications to the waiver policy as it applies to individuals initially covered by the Section 3679 (c) provide institutions the opportunity to extend the duration of the waiver through the duration of a student's program of study for up to three years for degree completion. If a student receiving a waiver under this section has an institution-approved gap in education for a medical or other emergency, the institution may exercise discretion to reinstate the waiver.

Institutions have reported situations in which eligible service members or dependents have exhausted their federal benefit or have had emergencies that have caused a gap in their education. By extending this waiver, students will be able to complete their degree. Institutions have reported situations in which eligible service members or dependents have exhausted their federal benefit or have had emergencies that have caused a gap in their education. By extending this waiver, students will be able to complete the caused a gap in their education. By extending this waiver, students will be able to complete the process.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move to approve the first reading of proposed amendments to Board Policy V.T. Fee Waivers, as presented. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

 Boise State University – New Science Building – Planning and Design – Action Item

Mr. Coulson said the action item pertains to the new science research building project planning and design approval for Boise State University. The proposed new facility will have research, instructional and work space for those in interdisciplinary life sciences, with an emphasis on biological and biomedical research. Departments that will be partially or fully housed in the facility include Biology, Chemistry & Biochemistry, Physics, Biomolecular Sciences (BMOL), Neuroscience and other associated programs.

The new facility will include state-of-the-art laboratories, a mix of fixed and flexible faculty offices, graduate student and postdoc spaces, areas for collaboration, instruction and necessary support space. In addition, the building may provide some space for industry-university development and collaboration.

BSU's New Science Research Building has been a Board priority project for FY 24 and FY25 capital requests. The project was awarded \$17,936,000 by the Permanent Building Fund Advisory Council (PBFAC) in FY24. The total project cost provided by BSU to complete this 100,000-110,000 GSF project is presently estimated to be approximately between \$120M-\$130M.

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

Adhering to Board Policy V.K.4, BSU is requesting the Board approve for a cost not to exceed \$13,000,000.

Alicia Estey, Chief Financial Officer, Boise State University, asked to address the debt capacity related to construction costs for this project. BSU have intentionally reserved that capacity to help fund construction costs. BSU have a second major capital project request for 15 million dollars that's pending, and they will pursue grant funding for this facility. BSU is also prepared to finance up to 90 million dollars of the cost using very conservative revenue projections over the next 10 years. This will increase BSU's average debt service as a percent of their operating budget from 4.2 to 5.3%.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Liebich) I move to approve the request by Boise State University to proceed with planning and design for the new science research building for a cost not to exceed \$13M. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

3. University of Idaho - New Operating Agreement between the University and the University of Idaho Foundation, Inc. – Action Item

Mr. Gilbert said this item pertains to the new operating agreement between the University of Idaho and the University of Idaho Foundation. There are essentially 2 items in this request. Approval of the 2024 operating agreement between the University of Idaho and the University of Idaho Foundation, including authority for the president to execute the 2024 operating agreement in conformance to the terms that are in it.

In addition, and as a separate motion, the University seeks an extension of the temporary exception to Idaho State Board of Education Governing Policies and Procedures Section: V Financial Affairs, Subsection: E. Gifts and Affiliated Foundations 2.b.i.1 and 2.b.iii.3 granted by the Board in October 2023. The Loaned Employee Agreements are scheduled to terminate December 13, 2023. The 2024 Operating Agreement, if approved, will be effective July 1, 2024, with the implementation of the integration thereunder effective at that same time. Accordingly, the University seeks an extension of the temporary exception until the 2024 Operating Agreement is effective.

Integration of Advancement operations with the Foundation operations will result in a more positive donor experience and more secure donor data in keeping with industry standards. The financial model as implemented is cost neutral for the University and the Foundation, such that neither the Foundation nor the University will incur costs greater than those currently incurred.

BOARD ACTION

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

M/S (Gilbert / Roach) I move to approve the request by the University of Idaho to approve the 2024 Operating Agreement and to authorize the President of the University to execute the Operating Agreement in substantial conformance with Attachment 1, and to execute such other and further documents, including the ancillary documents as described in the Operating Agreement, as necessary to carry out the intention of the parties. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

AND

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Roach) I move to approve the request by the University of Idaho to extend the temporary waiver of Board Policy Section V. E. subsections 2.b.i.1 and 2.b.iii.3 granted at the August 23, 2023, Board meeting so as to allow the University to extend the temporary loaning of certain University employees to the University of Idaho Foundation until the Effective Date of the 2024 Operating Agreement approved above. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

RETIREMENT COMMITTEE

1. Optional Retirement Program – Defined Contribution Recordkeeping Services -Action Item

Mr. Gilbert shared that the Retirement Plan Committee (RPC) members and staff have worked closely with Multnomah to facilitate a thorough and deliberate RFP process. After careful consideration and extensive due diligence, the consensus of all committee members was to move forward with Fidelity. This review ensured that the ORP continues to meet industry best standards and practices, while saving plan participants money and providing more transparent investment and fee information.

Fidelity is being proposed by the RPC based on their commitment to participant solutions and services, lower and more transparent costs, best in class technology, and simplified administration. RPC members included Board members and staff, campus representatives from all eight (8) colleges and universities, as well as the Public Employee Retirement System of Idaho (PERSI).

The fees going forward with Fidelity will be 25% less than current recordkeeping fees being paid by participants. Once transition occurs to Fidelity, all participants will pay \$37 per year for the recordkeeping fee, reflected as a \$9.25 per quarter charge on participant statements. The savings that will be achieved by this transition only apply to participant accounts.

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Siddoway) I move to approve Fidelity as the Idaho State Board of Education 401(a) Optional Retirement Plan's sole provider of Defined Contribution Recordkeeping Services effective December 2, 2024. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

PLANNING, POLICY, AND GOVERNMENTAL AFFAIRS

1. Board Policy IV.D – Educator Preparation, Certification, and Standards - Second Reading – Action Item

Jenn Thompson, Chief Policy and Government Affairs Officer, Idaho State Board of Education said attachment 1 proposes revisions to Board Policy IV.D. that aligns the language in policy pertaining to content standards review committees with the existing language in IDAPA 08.02.03.128 pertaining to curricular materials review committees.

In addition to this change, a technical correction is proposed in paragraph 2.ff. of Board Policy IV.D. for the purpose of removing a no longer relevant reference to grades 5-9.

If the Board approves the second reading of the proposed changes the State Department of Education can begin utilizing the updated requirements for content standard review committees working through the spring of 2024.

Updating Section 1.a.i of Board Policy IV.D. to materially align with IDAPA 02.02.03.128, would provide the State Department of Education with the necessary flexibility to establish effective content review committees. This change would also further align administrative rule and Board policy and would serve to streamline the workload for the SDE staff that facilitates both Content Standards and Curricular Materials committees.

No changes have been made to the proposed language since the first reading was approved in October.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Liebich / Hill) I move to approve the second reading of proposed revisions to Board Policy IV.D. as presented in Attachment 1. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

2. STEM Action Center School Designation Standards Revision – Action Item

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

Ms. Thompson shared that the current Board-approved STEM School Designation Standards are out of-date and require action. The STEM Action Center saw reason to revisit their alignment with the legislative requirements. The Professional Learning Community (PLC) of Idaho STEM designated schools has expressed concern that Cognia's most up-to-date STEM standards have gaps in alignment with the requirements for STEM Designation laid out in Idaho Code. Additionally, they conveyed that the frequent revisions of Cognia's STEM Certification framework (and subsequent amendments of the Board-approved standards) make it difficult to have a consistent target to aim for when developing their programs. As such, since Fall 2022, the STEM AC has collaborated with administrators from the STEM School PLC to develop a new set of Idaho-specific STEM Designation Standards that are explicitly aligned to the expectations laid out in Idaho Code § 33-4701. These standards can be found in Attachment 1.

STEM Action Center staff have worked collaboratively with stakeholders to conduct a thorough review of the standards and have sought to develop a cost-saving plan for achieving STEM school designation for Idaho schools. The STEM Action Center advisory board reviewed the updated standards and the implementation plan and voted to bring this forward to the Board for approval.

If the Board approves the revised Idaho Standards for STEM School Designation, the STEM Action Center will begin evaluating schools for this designation using the updated standards and will require any external reviewers to demonstrate full alignment to the updated standards when making recommendations.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Liebich / Hill) I move to approve the revised Idaho Standards for STEM School Designation as presented in Attachment 1. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

3. Alternative Paraprofessional Assessment – Action Item

Ms. Thompson shared that a paraprofessional is a non-certificated individual who is employed by a school district or charter school to support educational programming. Paraprofessionals must work under the direct supervision of a properly certificated staff member for the areas they are providing support. Paraprofessionals cannot serve as the teacher of record and may not provide direct instruction to a student unless the paraprofessional is working under the direct supervision of a teacher.

The Board has previously approved an assessment, the Educational Testing Service (ETS) ParaPraxis exam. However, an alternative assessment has been requested by several districts.

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

Boise School District has developed an internal assessment and is requesting that the Board approve this assessment as an alternative to the ETS ParaPraxis exam.

School districts have communicated the need for an alternative assessment over the past few months. This includes phone calls and emails received by Board staff as well as a resolution proposed to the Idaho School Boards Association (ISBA), requesting that legislation be run to allow alternative assessments to be determined at the district level. On November 17, 2023, ISBA members voted to move forward with proposed legislation. If the Board approves this request, the need for related legislation would likely be mitigated.

The proposed assessment request was also reviewed by the Professional Standards Commission on December 7, 2023.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Liebich / Keough) I move to approve the Paraprofessional Alternative Academic Assessment and cut score to be used as a State Board approved Academic Assessment for qualifying paraprofessionals, as submitted in Attachment 1. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

5. Educator Pipeline Report - Information Item

Ms. Thompson shared that the 2022-2023 Educator Pipeline Report examines data on teacher supply, demand, and retention. A selection of the key findings from the report are listed in the executive summary. The report concludes with a recap of relevant current projects and recommendations for future areas of focus.

Key findings include:

- Idaho is a state facing population growth. As the population is projected to continue to boom in coming years, the demand for educators to serve the increased population of students is also expected to grow. Preliminary estimates show an older population of residents moving to Idaho, but additional work will need to be done to identify how overall in-migration to Idaho affects public school student enrollment.
- New educators from Idaho's educator preparation programs and out-of-state transfers are hypothetically sufficient to fulfill the staffing needs of local education agencies across the state—yet most individuals who hold a valid Idaho certificate do not serve in Idaho public schools. Additionally, although the number of new educators accepting positions in Idaho schools has steadily increased over time, the current rate of growth is unlikely to address the projected demand unless

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

Idaho dramatically improves its ability to retain the qualified educators it already has.

There are strong indications that the increases in base compensation associated with the career ladder have had a positive impact on this front. The retention rate among educators in their first seven years of service has seen meaningful improvement, and local education agencies along the state's border no longer seem to face more serious retention issues than their interior counterparts. However, there are still substantial opportunities for improvement—especially when it comes to retaining the state's most experienced educators and those who teach in rural locales. Identifying policy mechanisms that can address those needs will be vital to avoiding a worsening shortage as an unusually large cohort of teachers with over 10 years of experience moves closer to retirement.

Board staff will be working with the Planning, Policy and Governmental Affairs Committee and education stakeholders to further identify strategies and policy amendments to help strengthen Idaho's educator pipeline.

Board staff recommends continued focus on initiatives to attract and recruit new teachers, including the development of varied pathways to certification as well as a new focus on initiatives to retain teachers, including the development of strong mentorship programs.

For a more in-depth review of the data please go to <u>https://boardofed.idaho.gov/event/board-meeting-boise-17/</u> Planning, Policy and Governmental Affairs, Tab 5.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

4. Registered Teacher Apprenticeship Program Standards – Action Item

Ms. Thompson reminded the Board that Senate Bill 1069 (2023) made administrative changes in the current certification requirements to allow individuals who complete a teacher apprenticeship program that is registered with the U.S. Department of Labor and approved by the State Board of Education to be eligible for certification. The amendments to Idaho Code §33-1201 allow for a student serving in a practicum, internship, or student-teaching position under the supervision of a certificated staff person to be paid. The amendments also allow individuals who successfully complete an approved registered apprenticeship program to be eligible for standard certification.

In July 2023, Board staff began facilitating work sessions to obtain recommendations for Idaho's first registered teacher apprenticeship. The discussions of the workgroup and the subgroups informed the proposed Registered Apprenticeship Program (RAP) presented to the Board for consideration.

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

In an apprenticeship model, the prospective teacher works fulltime in a classroom, under the supervision of a mentor, for one to three years while completing a personalized plan of formal training and demonstrating on-the-job and related technical instruction competencies. Upon completion of the RAP, the apprentice becomes a fullycertified teacher.

The structure of the RAP requires an approved apprentice to be employed and complete a minimum of 2,000 hours of on-the-job training and a minimum of 144 hours of related technical instruction training each year. An apprentice that enters the program with more experience and prior learning may take as little as one year to complete the apprenticeship. An apprentice entering the program with less experience and prior learning may take as many as three years to complete the apprenticeship.

The goal of an apprenticeship program is to create a pathway for candidates who do not have the opportunity to stop working full-time while they pursue certification through a more traditional pathway along with those who are place-bound. It provides a pathway for LEAs to select candidates they want to hire and whose development they are invested in, but who are not able to pursue certification through other pathways.

If the Board approves the registered teacher apprenticeship program standards as presented, the Office of the State Board of Education staff can submit the standards to the Idaho Department of Labor/U.S. Department of Labor for approval. Upon approval from the Idaho Department of Labor/U.S. Department of Labor, the program will be available for Idaho LEAs.

Board staff will then work with various stakeholders over the next few months to finalize implementation procedures and begin exploring funding mechanisms as well as a second RAP for special education teachers.

In addition, the Idaho Department of Labor will also proceed with hiring an Apprenticeship Program Specialist to be hosted in the OSBE office and tasked with supporting OSBE and IDCTE apprenticeship programs.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Liebich / Critchfield) I move to approve the registered teacher apprenticeship standards, as submitted in Attachment 1. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

6. ARP ESSER SEA Set Aside Funds Designations Proposal – Action Item

Alison Henken, K-12 Accountability and Projects Program Manager, Idaho State Board of Education, summarized the data. She shared that the federal American Rescue Plan

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

(ARP) Act was enacted on March 11, 2021. It provided a third installment of funding for Elementary and Secondary Emergency Relief, referred to as ARP ESSER. Idaho's original allocation was \$439,942,041; this was later adjusted to \$440,131,920. Of the funds allocated to Idaho, 90% (\$396,118,728) was required to be distributed directly to local education agencies based on the US Department of Education's Title I methodology and 10% (\$44,013,192) could be set aside to be used by the state education agency (SEA).

Part one of this proposal is to designate all of the remaining learning loss funds (\$236,596) to the Math Accelerated Learning Collaborative. Statewide data reviews have demonstrated that K-12 math achievement was more impacted by the pandemic and that recovery has been slower. The additional funds will be used by the Math Accelerated Learning Collaborative to address needs that have arisen during the work thus far, including serving additional schools and teachers, developing specific training for administrators, and establishing a teacher leader cohort.

Part two of this proposal is to designate all of the remaining \$2,002,638 of summer learning and after school learning funds to the STEM Action Center and Idaho Out of-School Network. The funds will be spent to support additional rounds of grants for implementation of summer and after school programming and professional development for staff implementing the programs.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Liebich / Hill) I move to approve the Math Accelerated Learning Collaborative request from Boise State University, Idaho State University, and University of Idaho to use ARP ESSER SEA Set Aside learning loss funds to provide math professional development support for Idaho educators for an amount not to exceed the \$236,596. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

AND

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Liebich / Hill) I move to approve the After School and Summer Learning Collaborative request from the Idaho STEM Action Center and the Idaho Out-of-School Network to use ARP ESSER SEA Set Aside summer learning and after school learning funds to provide summer and after school program grants and professional development support for Idaho educators for an amount not to exceed the \$2,002,638. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

At this time the Board took a 15-minute break returning at 2:30 p.m.

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

1. Superintendent Update – Information Item

The Superintendent shared the following information with the other Board members.

- The 11-person council has been reviewing grant proposals to help spend the \$45 million allocated for this grant. Meetings were held in August and October and to date \$36 million has been allocated. This has been a lot of work for the council as requests for funding came in at over \$100 million. The next meeting of the council will be February 2024.
- SDE staff have worked over the summer to draft the budget being presented to the Legislature when they convene in January. That budget is currently a 2.9 percent increase over last year's budget. However, enrollment numbers are projected to be flat with little to no growth in the state. Even though the Department of Labor estimates that new people are arriving in Idaho in large numbers they are not bringing in children and people are not having as many children as they did in past years.
- Graduation Requirements Update Greg Wilson, Chief of Staff, State Department of Education, Jenn Thompson, and Dr. Linda Clark will be part of a working group to develop graduation requirements that will be brought back to the full Board in June. These requirements will then have to be brought to the Legislature in 2025 for approval so this project is a still a couple of years out from completion.

Board President Dr. Clark asked the Superintendent if CTE had been able to help with the allocation of funding from the \$45 million dollars. Superintendent Critchfield said Dr. Clay Long, Chief Administrator, Career Technical Education was one of the 11 members of the council seeing to the distribution of funds. He has been instrumental in helping the various CTE programs see that by adding in a few more provisions in the courses they want to offer, it would allow them to ask for increased funding.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

2. Fall Idaho Reading Indicator (IRI) review – Information Item

Ryan Cantrell, Deputy Superintendent, State Department of Education, gave the IRI update to the Board.

Fall's Idaho Reading Indicator (IRI) administration occurred between August 1, 2023, and September 29, 2023. By default, students participated in person, but the state again enabled a remote administration option to provide additional flexibility for schools and students. The Idaho Department of Education (Department) matches the IRI results to the October public school enrollment data to create a final dataset.

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

- The preliminary results show that Idaho schools continue to make progress in the fall IRI with a one or two percentage point increase in proficiency across grade levels.
- Students exhibited results from the "summer slide" effect that takes place. Summer slide" is the tendency for students to lose some of the achievement gains they made during the previous school year. This is due to three factors:
 - Lack of daily application of learned skills
 - Not reading at home
 - o Little/no new learning
- Students therefore score lower on the IRI in the Fall than they do in the Spring. What the data hopes to show is that students are losing less and less as they go from grade to grade; they come into first grade with a higher score than they did in kindergarten for example.
- Data for current kindergarteners shows they are coming into the school year a little more prepared than in previous years. SDE will now spend time trying to find out why this is so.
- When a student enters second and third grade the testing scores flatten out. The students are not losing any knowledge, but they aren't gaining any either.

Mr. Cantrell was asked if the data collected was consistent with data from 5 or 10 years ago and was the data reviewed in the same way. Mr. Cantrell said no, the data was tracked back to 8 years ago and what can be seen is that when students take a week or two off from school for fall or spring break scores would dip a little but then rebound and the students would finish the school year strong.

Superintendent Critchfield said choosing the right curriculum that's founded in the science of reading is a focus for the upcoming school year using this curriculum to better prepare teachers in the art of teaching students to read. However as long as kindergarten is not legally mandated parents are going to opt in and out of kindergarten. This leads to many first graders not being as well prepared as those students who did attend kindergarten.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

3. Remote and Necessary, Athol Elementary – Action Item

Gideon Tolman, Chief Financial Officer, State Department of Education, shared that historically, Athol Elementary School has been treated as a "separate elementary school" as defined in Section 33-1001(26), Idaho Code. However, during a recent review of schools with separate school status, it was determined that Athol Elementary School is located 9.3 miles from the nearest elementary school or district office, meaning 0.7 miles less than the 10.0 miles required to be considered a separate elementary school.

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

If the Board approves the request to designate Athol Elementary School as a Remote School, the district's funding for FY24 "shall be allowed adequate funding within the support program for an acceptable educational program for the students of the school." Section 33-1103(3), Idaho Code.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Critchfield / Keough) I move to grant Lakeland Joint School District's request for Athol Elementary School to be designated as a "Remote School" pursuant to Section 33-1003(3), Idaho Code, and, for funding purposes, to treat it as a "separate elementary school" as described in Section 33-1003(2)(a), Idaho Code. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

- 4. Assessment Item Review Committee Recommendations Action Item *Removed from Agenda*
- 5. Federal Funds Request Action Item

Mr. Cantrell shared that Board action here today would update the available use of the ARP ESSER SEA set aside funds and continue to fulfill the ongoing need for student behavioral health supports.

A November 2022 survey from Idaho's second largest school district found that 30% of junior high students and 44% of high schoolers are depressed at a moderate to severe level. The same survey found that about 29% of junior high students and 34% of high schoolers have struggled with suicide ideation at least once in the last six months and 22% of junior high students and 29% of high schoolers said they would not ask for help from anyone. According to the survey, stress and social isolation are the leading factors for both depression and suicidal ideation among students in this district.

To this end, the Superintendent convened a Student Behavioral Health working group that has been meeting since she took office in January 2023. The FY 2025 SDE budget includes a request to support this initiative.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Critchfield / Keough) I move to authorize \$120,000 of the ARP ESSER SEA Set-Aside funds for administrative costs to be allocated for a comprehensive suicide prevention and student wellness pilot tool for the remainder of the 2023-2024 school year. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

INFORMATIONAL

BAHR

- 1. FY 2023 Financial Ratios Information Item
- 2. FY 2023 Net Position Reports Information Item

PPGA

3. State Review of Teacher Evaluations Annual Report – Information Item **SDE**

- 4. English Learners Proficiency Annual Report Information Item
- 5. Professional Standards Committee Annual Report Information Item
- 6. FY 2023 K-12 Schools Accreditation Report Information Item

WORK SESSION

IRSA

A. Open Education in Idaho

Dr. Bliss and Dr. Jonathan Lashley, Academic Technology Program Manager, Idaho State Board of Education led this workgroup session and said the purpose of this work session is threefold:

1. Update the Board on progress related to open education in Idaho, in connection with the Board's goal of increasing access and affordability of higher education for all Idahoans.

2. Apprise the Board of funding requests related to open education going to the Legislature in the upcoming session.

3. Request input from Board members regarding the nature and scope of Board staff presentations of outcomes to the Legislature.

Dr. Lashley shared the following.

- Board policy positions institutional support and recognition of Open Educational Resources (OER) as a key element of institutions' instructional materials access and affordability plans. Policy III.U. defines several required elements that must be included in institutional plans for course materials and identifies several optional elements that institutions may consider including. The policy also requires institutions to submit their plans to the Board office and provide annual reports related to implementation and outcomes.
- The four-year institutions submitted initial plans in summer 2022 and reported on progress toward implementation in June 2023. While not required to develop or submit plans under policy III.U., the community colleges electively adopted these requirements in response to the \$1M in funding provided by the Legislature in FY2022 to support Project Z Degree. With this funding, the colleges have developed pathways that allow students to complete an associate degree while paying zero or very low instructional material cost.

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

- Over the past three years, the Board office has conducted a statewide survey of faculty to better understand their course-level efforts to increase access and affordability via instructional material choices.
- In 2024, the community colleges are requesting \$400K in ongoing funding from the Legislature to continue and expand the Project Z Degree initiative. The Board office is requesting an additional \$100K in ongoing funding to support open education initiatives across all institutions.
- Data from the self-reported Faculty Survey shows that many teachers are using required materials that cost \$30 or less. In short teachers are finding low-cost ways to get materials to students other than using the OER system.
- Moving forward the institutions will summit data every June on how OER is impacting the student population and what their plans are moving forward.

Dr. Bliss asked the Board if this was the type of report they wanted to receive on this topic or should the data be presented to subcommittee Instruction, Research and Student Affairs committee instead. The Board members said this was definitely a topic they wanted to hear about in full committee meetings.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

To see a complete copy of this presentation please go to; <u>https://boardofed.idaho.gov/event/board-meeting-boise-17/</u> Work session, Tab A.

PPGA

B. Strategic Plan and Performance Measures Revision Recommendation – Information Item

Ms. Thompson led the discussion.

- The strategic planning process is a year-long cycle. In February the Board approves any updates or revisions to its five-year strategic plan.
- In April, institutions and agencies governed by the Board submit drafts of their strategic plans for review.
- In June all plans are finalized and submitted to the Division of Financial Management along with budget requests for the next fiscal year.
- In August, the Board begins reviewing data and information to help inform continuous improvement. This includes reviewing performance measure outcome reports and engaging in a work session to review recommendations from the Accountability Oversight Committee.
- In October, the Board engages in a second work session to review performance measure outcomes based on the K-20 strategic plan.
- In December of each year, the Board considers recommendations for strategic plan revisions in preparation for a February final approval.

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

The question before the Board today is what are the top 10 measures the Board would like as part of their strategic plan since only 10 measures can be brought forward.

For example. Goal 1, Objective A's task is to Develop a single K-20 dashboard by end of FY24. That goal needs to be updated to say FY25. In order to accomplish this task Board staff will have to work with the IT team to develop an ISEE Modernization Update to be brought back to the PPGA Committee.

Discussion ensued on why the dashboard work has still not been completed even though it's been two years. It was said that having all of the K-20 data in one location would be helpful in being able to show student growth and student outcomes. Dr. Clark reminded everyone that the Board said they have three priorities: K-3 Literacy, K5-9 Math and Graduation Go-On Rates.

For Goal 2: Educational Readiness - it currently says to focus on ELA, Math and Science and the recommendation is to focus, as far as the strategic plan goes, more on Math proficiency.

For Goal 3: Educational Attainment - the recommendation was to move measure 3 to a different section of the strategic plan since it deals with timely completion.

Some of the changes outlined in the strategic plan need to be adjusted to work for 2 and 4-year institutions. Board staff will therefore work with our research team and institutional researchers to make sure we phrase that measure appropriately, so it works for all institutions.

For Goal 3: Access - it was recommended to remove measures 1-5 out of the strategic plan and have reporting done separately in a college affordability report and refocus the strategic plan on measures within our control.

For Goal 4: Workforce Readiness - a suggestion for FY23 is to add a new measure which will need a benchmark in measuring the percent of high school students participating in apprenticeships.

Ms. Thompson said currently there are 33 strategic measures in the plan. Her recommendation before today was to narrow that focus to 17 and then cut more from the report to get to the top 10 measures. Based on the discussion today Ms. Thompson will return to the office and redraft the strategic plan utilizing the suggestions heard during the discussion today and return with a revised strategic plan at a future Board meeting.

DRAFT Minutes December 13, 2023

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

To see a complete copy of this presentation please go to: <u>https://boardofed.idaho.gov/event/board-meeting-boise-17/</u> Work session, Tab B.

There being no further business a motion to adjourn was entertained.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Critchfield / Keough) I move to adjourn the meeting at 4:40 p.m. (MT). A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

DRAFT Minutes December 14, 2023



SPECIAL BOARD OF EDUCATION MEETING December 14, 2023 Minutes Office of the State Board of Education OSBE Conference Room Suite 307 Boise, ID 83702

A special meeting of the Idaho State Board of Education was held at the offices of the Idaho State Board of Education on December 14, 2023. Board President Dr. Linda Clark called the meeting to order at 8:15 a.m.

Present

Dr. Linda Clark, President William G. Gilbert, Jr., Vice-President Superintendent Critchfield, Secretary Dr. David Hill Kurt Liebich Shawn Keough Cally Roach Cindy Siddoway

<u>Absent</u>

None

Thursday, December 14, 2023 – 9:00 a.m. (Mountain Time)

EXECUTIVE SESSION – (Closed to the Public)

Action Item to go into Executive Session - No action taken in Executive Session. (Idaho State University)

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Hill) I move the Board go into Executive Session pursuant to Idaho Code Section 74-206(1)(a) "to consider hiring a public officer, employee, staff member or individual agent, wherein the respective qualities of individuals are to be evaluated in order to fill a particular vacancy or need." A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Keough) I move to end executive session and reconvene in open session. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

DRAFT Minutes December 14, 2023

Post Executive Session Statement

The Board convened in Executive Session to consider personnel matters under Idaho Code Section 74-206(1)(a). The Board concluded its discussion and took no action on the matters discussed. If action is necessary in these matters it will occur at a meeting properly noticed under the Open Meeting Law.

There being no further business a motion to adjourn was entertained.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Siddoway) I move to adjourn the meeting at 4:25 p.m. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 8-0.

DRAFT Minutes December 21, 2023



SPECIAL BOARD MEETING December 21, 2023 Idaho State University ICCU Bengal Alumni Center 1601 E. Bonneville Street Pocatello, ID 83201

A special meeting of the Idaho State Board of Education was held via Zoom teleconference December 21, 2023, with the call originating from Idaho State University in Pocatello, ID. Board President Dr. Linda Clark called the meeting to order at 1:00 p.m. (MT).

Present

Dr. Linda Clark, President William G. Gilbert, Jr., Vice-President Kurt Liebich Superintendent Critchfield, Secretary Dr. David Hill Cindy Siddoway Shawn Keough Cally Roach

Absent

None

Thursday, December 21, 2023 - 1:00 p.m. (Mountain Time)

Prior to the start of the meeting Dr. Clark asked for a moment of personal privilege. She thanked the co-chairs of the ISU President Search Committee; Board members Cally Roach and Cindy Siddoway for their very capable direction of the search committee and in going through more than 80 applicants to bring five outstanding candidates for the board's consideration. She also thanked Mr. Matt Freeman, Executive Director of the Idaho State Board of Education for the vast amount of time he spent supporting the search committee in these efforts.

BUSINESS AFFAIRS AND HUMAN RESOURCES

1. Idaho State University - Consideration of Acting President Appointment - Action Item

Mr. Gilbert said the first item on the agenda is consideration of filling an acting president appointment for ISU. Recognizing the need for continuity of executive leadership and to bridge the 28-day time period between retiring President Satterlee's last day on

DRAFT Minutes December 21, 2023

December 30, 2023, and with the expected start date of the candidate to be considered being January 29, 2024, the Board recommends that Brian Sagendorf, current ISU Vice President of Operations, fill the interim period as acting president of ISU.

Mr. Sagendorf currently serves as ISU's Vice President of Operations. In that capacity he oversees Human Resources, Environmental Health, Safety and Sustainability, Public Safety, Facilities Services, and University Events. Prior to this role he served as ISU's Chief HR Officer for nine years. He has worked at ISU for over 20 years and is also an ISU alum. He is widely known and respected on campus as a thoughtful leader.

Following Board Policy 2 F, subsection 2 B.ii, it is recommended that the temporary salary for the 28-day interim period from January 1, 2024, through January 28, 2024, be \$32,200. Board Policy II.F.2.b.ii. provides that "[a]ppointments to acting or interim positions shall be at base salary rates no greater than ten percent (10%) more than the appointees' salary rate immediately prior to accepting the interim appointment or ninety-five percent (95%) of the prior incumbent's rate, whichever is greater."

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Siddoway) I move to approve the appointment of Brian Sagendorf as Acting President of Idaho State University, for the period January 1, 2024, through January 28, 2024, dates inclusive, and to authorize a temporary salary for that period in the amount of \$32,200. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 6-0. Due to a technical difficulty votes were not recorded for Board members Roach and Superintendent Critchfield.

There were no comments or questions from the Board.

2. Idaho State University - Consideration of President Appointment - Action Item

Mr. Gilbert recapped the following for the Board members.

On June 12, 2023, President Kevin Satterlee announced his retirement effective December 31, 2023, after leading Idaho State University (ISU) for the past five and half years.

ISU engaged a search firm to manage the recruitment process. Board members Cally Roach and Cindy Siddoway were named as co-chairs of the ISU President Search Committee. Other members of the Committee included representatives from campus leadership, staff, faculty, students, athletics, ISU Foundation, Shoshone-Bannock Tribes, and the Pocatello business community.

DRAFT Minutes December 21, 2023

The Committee screened over 80 candidates, narrowing the field to 12 semi-finalists. The Committee interviewed the 12 semi-finalists over two days and identified five finalists for the Board to interview and consider.

The Board met in executive session on December 14, 2023, to interview and evaluate the qualities of the five finalists.

The candidate being brought forth to be the next president of Idaho State University is Dr. Robert Wagner. Dr. Wagner comes to ISU after serving at Utah State University for 16 years. Most recently as Utah State's executive vice president and chief operating officer. His tenure at Utah State also included serving as vice president of academic and instruction services and executive vice provost and dean of academic and instructional services. This appointment would be effective January 29, 2024, for a term of two- and one-half years at an annual salary of \$420,000.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Liebich) I move to approve the appointment of Dr. Robert Wagner as President of Idaho State University, effective January 29, 2024, for a term of two and one half years, at an annual salary of \$420,000, and to authorize the Board President to execute an employment agreement with Dr. Wagner. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 6-0. *Due to a technical difficulty votes were not recorded for Board members Roach and Superintendent Critchfield.

Dr. Clark thanked the Board members and said that by your action, we have appointed Dr. Robert Wagner as the next president of Idaho State University. Congratulations to Dr. Wagner.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

There being no further business a motion to adjourn was entertained.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Gilbert / Keough) I move to adjourn the meeting at 1:06 p.m. (MT). A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 6-0. *Due to a technical difficulty votes were not recorded for Board members Roach and Superintendent Critchfield.

Dr. Clark said thank you very much, this meeting is adjourned. As a reminder, additional activities are taking place at Idaho State University as announced in the media.

DRAFT Minutes January 9, 2024



Special Board of Education Meeting January 9, 2024 Idaho State Board of Education OSBE Conference Room 650 West State Street, Suite 307 Boise, ID 83720

A special meeting of the Idaho State Board of Education was held at the offices of the Idaho State Board of Education on January 9, 2024. Board President Dr. Linda Clark called the meeting to order at 1:00 p.m. (Mountain Time).

<u>Present</u>

Dr. Linda Clark, President Superintendent Critchfield, Secretary Shawn Keough Kurt Liebich Cally Roach Cindy Siddoway

<u>Absent</u>

William G. Gilbert, Jr., Vice-President

Dr. David Hill

Tuesday, January 9, 2024 – 1:00 p.m. (Mountain Time)

PLANNING, POLICY, AND GOVERNMENTAL AFFAIRS

1. Idaho State University (ISU) SU Holt Arena Renaming – Action Item – Acting President Brian Sagendorf

Mr. Liebich introduced ISU acting President Brian Sagendorf who shared the following with the Board. He said that Idaho Central Credit Union (ICCU) has been a valued partner to Idaho State University and has provided philanthropic support to the University in many ways over the years. ICCU has committed a capital gift of \$6 million in support of Idaho State University Athletics over the next 12 years.

Pauline Thiros, Director of Athletics, Idaho State University, shared how the renaming of the Arena would not replace Dubby Holt's legacy at ISU. In fact, ISU developed an initial and immediate plan to honor Dubby Holts legacy in Bengal Athletics and at the university in time for the fall season. Plans are underway to chronicle Dubby's contributions with a large mural in the north side concourse, as a permanent display in

DRAFT Minutes January 9, 2024

what will be a very dramatic hall of champions currently being designed in the Alumni Center.

As work continues on the grounds and the exterior of the arena, development of additional ways to recognize Dubby and ensure that patrons well into the future understand the role he played in making the facility possible are under way.

The annual gift totaling \$6 million dollars over 12 years represents timely and critical support for student athletes. This gift will help ISU meet the significant obligations facing them to comply with the requirements of the new Big Sky Conference strategic plan such as reaching maximum scholarship equivalencies, employing the NCAA maximum number of coaches, prioritizing the scheduling of home games to keep student athlete's home and in the classroom and not on the road for 5 or 6 weeks. It includes providing the cost of attendance assistance to our student athlete at a minimum threshold. And constructing fueling stations with increased nutritional resources. There will also be a nutritionist on staff as well as mental health counseling.

In addition, this gift will allow ISU to play two contractually arranged FBS games to generate approximately a million dollars that will go towards the athletics budget every year.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Liebich / Roach) I move to approve the renaming of Holt Arena to the ICCU Dome in recognition of ICCU's charitable capital gifts to renovate the arena. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 6-0. William G. Gilbert, Jr. and Dr. David Hill were absent from voting.

Mrs. Roach asked if any consideration was given when negotiating with ICCU in retaining or incorporating the whole name for the arena which included the mini dome from the original honor. Ms. Thiros said yes, many combinations of names were discussed with ICCU which would have combined all of the names but ultimately the decision was made to call it the ICCU dome.

Mrs. Roach said 12 years seems like a long time to be committed, and while this was a lot of money, was the time commitment also part of the negotiations. Ms. Thiros said it was. Many of these agreements can be anywhere from 10 to 20 years so the length of this commitment is pretty common.

Dr. Clark said she knew a lot of time and energy had gone into bringing this forward, and asked Ms. Thiros to elaborate a little bit on the process used to gain input from the various segments of the ISU community concerning this name change. Ms. Thiros said that the conversations took place largely inside the University community, with ICCU

DRAFT Minutes January 9, 2024

executives and a lot of phone calls with various University stakeholders. Everyone was asked to share their feelings in moving forward with the name change.

Superintendent Critchfield asked if anyone had reached out to Dubby Holt's family to get their input on this issue. Ms. Thiros said she did speak with Dubby's great niece and his great nephew when they attended the Big Sky Conference Sports Hall of Fame that honored Dubby, and they were supportive. Even though they love seeing his name on the Arena he was first and foremost about doing what was best for the students and this deal would have tickled him as he was a big wheeler dealer.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

1. Assessment Item Review Committee Recommendations – Action Item

Superintendent Critchfield gave a short recap of why this agenda item has been brought forward. She said that around the state, parents to teachers, administrators, charters, and traditional public schools review test questions, which takes place every year. However, there's one particular passage that rose to a level of scrutiny and the committee asked that this be brought to the Board's attention.

Ryan Cantrell, Assistant Superintendent of Public Instruction, State Department of Education, continued the discussion. In accordance with Section 33-134, Idaho Code, a review committee of thirty (30) individuals from each of the six (6) educational regions in the state met in the fall to review computer adaptive test questions.

The committee is authorized to make recommendations to the State Board of Education and the State Department of Education to revise or eliminate summative computer adaptive test questions from the assessment forms.

After reviewing the questions, the Assessment Review Committee recommended the removal of one (1) Grade 11 ISAT ELA/Literacy stimulus set (reading passage and related questions) which was determined to not pass the Idaho Bias and Sensitivity guidelines. This stimulus set affected 14 total items.

Superintendent Critchfield stressed that the State Department of Education believes that we can still assess the information and the skill set of a student within the English Language Arts test with a different question.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Liebich / Critchfield) I move to adopt the recommendation of the Assessment Review Committee for the removal of one (1) Grade 11 ISAT ELA/Literacy

DRAFT Minutes January 9, 2024

stimulus set as submitted. A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 6-0. William G. Gilbert, Jr. and Dr. David Hill were absent from voting.

Mr. Liebich asked a clarifying question. He said in his pre-read he noticed that the cost of making this change would be in the realm of \$57,000 and wondered at the high cost of making a change to just one question. Mr. Cantrell said the cost is to reconfigure the item bank. This includes psychometric services to ensure the testing form without the removed items continues to produce valid and reliable scores. The details of these psychometric services are outlined in the 200-page technical report produced by Cambium Assessment, Inc. annually. The actual cost will depend on the acceptance of the items by the Smarter Balance Assessment Consortium ("Consortium"). If the Consortium also decides to remove the item for all participating states, Idaho does not have to pay to reconfigure the item bank specific to Idaho.

There were no further comments or questions from the Board.

There being no further business a motion to adjourn was entertained.

BOARD ACTION

M/S (Critchfield / Keough) I move to adjourn the meeting at 1:32 p.m. (MT). A roll call vote was taken, and the motion carried 6-0. William G. Gilbert, Jr. and Dr. David Hill were absent from voting.